W-2-548 Rev. 05/23



Human Resources Administration

Department of Homeless Services

DSS Accountability Office

Molly Wasow Park Commissioner

Jill Berry DSS First Deputy Commissioner

Bedros Leon Boodanian Chief Accountability Officer

151 West Broadway New York, NY 10013

212 274 5600 tel

August 13, 2025

boodanianb@dss.nyc.gov

Mr. Joseph Gillooly NYS Office of the State Comptroller 59 Maiden Lane, 21st Floor New York, NY 10038

Re: Agency Response to the Office of the State Comptroller's (OSC) Follow Up Audit Report of the NYC Department of Homeless Services' (DHS) Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC). (2024-F-38)

Dear Mr. Gillooly,

We have received the Office of the State Comptroller's (OSC) Follow Up Audit Report of the Department of Homeless Services (DHS) Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) (2024-F-38). The purpose of the follow up audit was to determine whether the Agency implemented recommendations contained in OSC's initial audit report from 2019 (2019-N-8).

Please find enclosed our Agency response in the form of a Corrective Action Plan (CAP) which identifies the actions already taken as well as those that will be taken to address the recommendations noted in the report.

There were a total of eleven recommendations in the initial 2019 audit report. Upon review of supporting documentation provided by the Agency during the follow up audit, OSC determined that two recommendations were fully implemented, seven were partially implemented, and two were not implemented.

The Agency appreciates the time and attention provided by OSC to its officials in going over the details of every recommendation. However, DHS disagrees with five of nine recommendations that OSC considers either partially implemented or not implemented.

Specifically, for the two recommendations that OSC deemed "not implemented", please note the following.

Recommendation 2:

Investigate and recover the costs associated with front door supervisory hours, as appropriate.

The Agency disagrees with OSC that this recommendation was not implemented. DHS provided OSC with screenshots from BRC's payroll company ADP, which showed detailed records for the Jack Ryan Residence shelter supervisors for the audit years of 2017 – 2019. OSC did not notify the Agency that this documentation did not satisfy their request. Nevertheless, DHS reaffirms that it reviewed the hours associated with front door supervisors and that it did not need to recover associated costs from BRC.

Recommendation 9:

Complete year-end closeouts on time.

DHS partially agrees with this recommendation but notes that although timely budget closeouts are an Agency priority, they are not fully within the Agency control. There are functions that require OMB approval in order to close out budgets that may also require amendments, which can also add time to the approval process. Despite these challenges, the Agency continues to emphasize the importance of timely budget closeouts by regularly sending reminders to providers, examples of which were previously shared with OSC.

Please refer to the enclosed Corrective Action Plan (CAP) for additional details on all recommendations that were deemed by OSC as either "not implemented" or "partially implemented."

We are confident that our response to this follow up audit demonstrates the Agency's commitment to continually improving its operations. Should you have any questions regarding the enclosed, please contact Victoria Arzu, Executive Director of the DSS External Audit Facilitation Team (EAFT) at 929-221-7067.

We thank OSC for your partnership as we continue our critical mission.

Yours sincerely,

Bedros L. Boodanían

Bedros L. Boodanian DSS Chief Accountability Officer

Enclosures

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Audit Number: 2027-1-30			Datc. 0/15/2025
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
Recommendation 1:	Disagree	Status – Partially Implemented	Disagree
Review and recover, as appropriate, \$1,428,199 in reported expenses that were not in compliance with the Fiscal Manual, Cost Manual, and JRR contract.	The allocation does not take into account the square footage allocation referenced by BRC. BRC has provided DHS with calculations that allocate space differently. Additionally, OSC did not take into account documentation that was provided by BRC as it relates to staff. The methodology provided by BRC is a reasonable approach to allocation and would reduce the disallowance. Additionally, the \$1.45 million includes recoveries that BRC would need to retroactively charge other DHS programs in the building. DHS will complete an analysis to determine a revised recovery amount that considers the above two concerns. Agency Corrective Action: N/A	Agency Action – Following the initial audit, DHS met with BRC and collected documentation pertaining to the \$1,428,199 in reported expenses that were not in compliance with the Fiscal manual. Cost Manual, and JRR contract. Based on their post-audit work and analysis, DHS recovered \$535,453 (37%).	DHS considers this recommendation implemented and disagrees with OSC's statement that "[b]ased on their post-audit work and analysis, DHS recovered 37%" of disallowed expenses. Citing 37% as the total amount of disallowances recouped by DHS is misleading. The Agency conducted multiple meetings with the Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) officials and collected additional supporting documents, which may have been missed by OSC during their initial audit. Based on the review of these documents, DHS recouped only those funds from BRC, for which supporting documents remained unavailable as well as the unallowable expenses that should not have been charged to the Agency. This amounted to \$535,453, which DHS recouped from BRC and which represents 100% of expenses that were not in compliance with the Fiscal Manual, Cost Manual, and the JRR contract.
		Officials explained that their analysis showed that much of the JRR contract expense overallocations noted in the initial audit report were offset by corresponding underallocations to other DHS-funded	was presented to OSC, DHS explained that it collected less than 100% of the allocation-related disallowances.
			over-allocation to the JRR contract – calculated by OSC

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Audit Number. 2024-F-30		Date. 6/13/2025	
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
		determined the JRR contract overallocations would not yield actual savings but would merely reshuffle funds owed to BRC.	- was offset by corresponding <i>under</i> -allocations to other DHS-funded programs in the building. These funds, which DHS analysis indicates <i>exceed \$600,000</i> , would not yield actual savings but would merely reshuffle funds that DHS rightfully owed to BRC. OSC did not contest the fact that some portions of their calculated disallowances were owed to other BRC contracts in the building and thus do not represent true potential savings nor did OSC produce alternative estimates or analyses of their own.
		Additionally, DHS officials told us that they do not recover funds for certain types of non-compliance. For example, DHS officials stated they do not disallow claimed expenses for client supplies based on the absence of written policy or sufficient inventory records. Although officials agreed that BRC did not have required inventory policy and records to support \$39,211 in client supply costs, DHS did not recover these costs because BRC provided DHS with invoices confirming the purchase. For another \$41,789 in non-compliant expenses, officials told us that they used their discretion not to recover this amount because services were provided.	recover funds for certain types of non-compliance." As explained to OSC during the course of the follow up audit regarding \$39,211 in client supply costs, the Agency reviewed invoices supporting this purchase, which is why there was no need to recoup this amount. These invoices were also shared with the auditors during

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

-			
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
		Nevertheless, we encourage DHS to review and recover expenses that are not in compliance with the Fiscal Manual, Cost Manual, and JRR contract.	contract and considers this recommendation fully implemented.
Recommendation 2:	Partially Agree	Status – Not Implemented	Disagree
	Agency Corrective Action: DHS will work with BRC to assess the entirety of front door spending, and to allocate costs to different programs as necessary. If after this comprehensive evaluation of front door costs a recoupment is necessary, DHS will recoup the funds.	Officials indicated they reviewed the rosters and determined DHS did not have to recover any costs associated with front door supervisory hours. We requested the rosters and documentation supporting	recommendation was not implemented. DHS provided OSC with screenshots from BRC's payroll company ADP, which showed such details as position name, job function, position ID, etc. for the Jack Ryan Residence shelter supervisors for the audit years of 2017 – 2019. In response to receipt of this information, OSC did not inform the Agency that this documentation did not
		However, officials did not provide us with documentation to support they specifically reviewed the hours associated with front door supervisors, which is what this recommendation pertains to.	<u> </u>

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Audit Number: 2024-1-30			Date: 0/15/2025
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
Recommendation 3:	Partially Agree	Status - Partially implemented	Partially Agree
Ensure that providers comply with their contractual requirements to retain sufficient documentation to support proper procurement and maintenance of required inventories.	While it is critical that providers comply with all contractual requirements, DHS also notes that these requirements may change over time. When evaluating providers' compliance with documentation requirements, it is critical to apply the standards that were in effect for the period under consideration. Agency Corrective Action: DHS and DSS monitor	Agency Action – After the initial audit, DHS officials obtained and reviewed BRC's equipment inventory and equipment inventory maintenance procedures. However, officials did not provide documentation demonstrating they obtained or reviewed BRC's supplies inventory and supplies inventory maintenance procedures.	which it takes seriously. To support this, the Agency regularly issues guidance, training and reminders to
	provider compliance with documentation requirements and other contractual obligations as a matter of course, including through use of third-party auditor firms.		covers in annual trainings, providers are required to submit their inventory management Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) for supplies at the start of a contract and annually upon request.
			As OSC stated in its report, DHS obtained and reviewed BRC's Inventory Management Policy. This policy, which was last updated on 8/9/2024 and is attached for reference, covers items purchased for \$500 or more including various types of supplies in Appendix A. However, the Agency will work with BRC to ensure that they develop a separate Supplies Inventory Maintenance Procedure.
		Further, as previously noted, DHS officials indicated they do not recover funds for certain types of non-compliance. For example, DHS does not disallow claimed expenses	,

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

		Date. 0/13/2023	
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
		for client supplies based on the absence of written policy or sufficient inventory records. Although officials agreed that BRC did not have the required supplies inventory policy and records to support \$39,211 in client supply costs, DHS did not recover these costs because BRC provided DHS with invoices confirming the purchases. While we acknowledge that DHS provides guidance and training to providers to help ensure compliance, more needs to be done to ensure providers comply with their contractual requirements to retain sufficient documentation to support proper procurement and maintenance of required inventories.	1
Recommendation 5:	Partially Agree	Status Partially Implemented	Partially Agree
Comply with existing internal policies and complete monthly expenditure reviews.		Services' (MOCS) current invoice procedure, which requires that two expenditure line items be reviewed per month. However, officials stated they could not find	review procedures as a matter of course. During the COVID-19 pandemic, many DHS staff left the Agency due to illness and/or retirement. This included program analysts who conducted monthly expenditure BRC reviews for the period of July 2019 through December

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Audit Number: 2024-1-30		Date. 0/15/2025	
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
	procedures as a matter of course. Under the MOCS invoice review policy released in early calendar year 2021, BRC invoices are subject to post-payment review, and DHS follows that policy.	December 2023 because these records were not retained. DHS officials stated that during COVID-19 pandemic, many DHS staff left agency due to illness and/or retirement. This included program analysts who conducted BRC monthly expenditure reviews for the period of July 2019 through December 2023, and DHS was unable to retrieve the associated records. However, since 2024, DHS has documented these expenditure reviews in the Procurement and Sourcing Solutions portal (PASSPort).	repository. This streamlines the retention process and removes the dependency of information retrieval from individual staff members' computers. Additionally, once the Vault feature is released in the City's Procurement and Sourcing Solutions Portal (PASSPort) database in the future, DHS will explore the feasibility
Recommendation 6:	Agree	Status- Partially Implemented	Partially Agree
Ensure that providers use the cash method of accounting until policies are changed and develop policies and procedures for authorizing changes to reporting methodology.	Review Policy is in effect as of January 1, 2021, and gives Providers the ability to invoice on an accrual basis with notification to DHS.	Agency Action – The MOCS Standard Health and Human Services Invoice Review Policy (SIRP) states that vendors must notify the contracting agency at the beginning of the fiscal year of their intention to claim on an accrual basis, with a list of anticipated line items impacted. DHS developed invoice review procedures to address this. However, the cash method of accounting is still required by the Fiscal manual. Although DHS officials indicated during the initial audit that they were in the process of amending Fiscal Manual to permit the accrual method accounting, they did not make change. Officials stated that DHS was waiting for the full transition to the PASSPort procurement platform before	(SIRP), providers may use the accrual method of accounting, as long as they notify the Agency at the beginning of the fiscal year. This SIRP-defined standard is also upheld in the DHS Invoice Review procedure. Beginning in 2024 the Agency transitioned to the Procurement and Sourcing Solutions Portal (PASSPort) as New York City's end-to-end procurement platform, which is designed to streamline all stages of the contracting process, including contract management and invoice payments. DHS was waiting for the full

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Audit Number. 2024-1-30		Date. 6/15/2025	
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
		1 2 2	practices. The DHS Fiscal Manual is now in its final stages of revision and will include updates on both cash and accrual methods of accounting.
Recommendation 7:	Agree	Status - Partially Implemented	Disagree with explanation
Review and approve all provider allocation methodologies.	Agency Corrective Action: DHS Fiscal Manual details acceptable allocation methodologies for various expenses. Numerous examples are detailed in the Fiscal Manual and the manual also notes that if a provider wants to deviate it must be approved by DHS. DHS reviews all allocations as a part of the annual budget submission.	Agency Action – DHS officials explained that each proposed allocation methodology is reviewed and approved by budget analyst, the budget director, and DHS program staff during budget submission process. Officials also indicated that the Fiscal Manual outlines acceptable methodologies for various expenses and states that providers must obtain prior approval from DHS before deviating from an approved methodology.	reviews, the Agency would not be able to conduct and present its follow-up allocation analysis to OSC as well as
		However, based on our discussions with DHS officials, it does not appear these reviews focus on whether the methodologies are fair, reasonable, and adequately supported.	

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

itulit (umbel . 2021 i 20			Date: 0/15/2025
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
Recommendation 9:	Agree	Status - Not Implemented	Partially Agree
Complete year-end closeouts on time.	Agency Corrective Action: Work with Providers to ensure that any final budget modifications are submitted on a timely basis and a final closeout invoice is submitted soon after the budget modification is reviewed and approved by DHS.	Agency Action – DHS did not complete year-end closeouts on time. For example, DHS has not completed BRC's year-end closeouts for fiscal years 2023 (more than 600 days overdue) and 2024 (more than 250 days overdue). DHS officials indicated that year-end closeouts are not fully within DHS's and the provider's control. They stated that the final closeouts require all invoices to be paid and depend on prior approval from the City's Office of management and Budget. They also stated that closeouts are delayed when there are pending amendments to add funds to prior fiscal years, and the registration process alone can take several months. Despite these challenges, DHS officials indicated they continue to emphasize the importance of time budget closeouts by regularly sending reminders to providers.	Agency prioritizes timely budget closeouts, they are not fully within the Agency and provider control. Final closeouts require all invoices to be paid and depend on prior approval from the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) for initiatives such as Prevailing Wage, Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA), Work Enhancement Initiative (WEI), new needs, and others. Closeouts are also delayed when there are pending amendments to add funds to prior fiscal years.

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

			Date: 0/15/2025	
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response	
Recommendation 10:	Agree	Status – Partially Implemented	Disagree with explanation	
to ensure that they are aware of the reimbursement	Agency Corrective Action: MOCS distributed the Standard Invoice Review Procedure to all providers. DSS developed a detailed training this year that is being rolled out to provider staff.	Agency Action – DHS officials noted several trainings that DHS rolled out, including trainings on the SIRP, budget/invoice review, and allocation methodology. While these trainings covered pertinent reimbursement topics, they do not cover other relevant requirements such as submitting inventory maintenance procedures and documenting inventory. During the initial audit, we found BRC did not comply with these requirements. DHS officials indicated DHS is currently developing an inventory management training to emphasize the instructions on how to maintain and document inventory records.	takes very seriously, as is evidenced by the below list of multiple training sessions rolled out by DHS as well as those that are continuously being developed by the Agency. As per the original corrective action plan submitted in response to OSC's initial 2019 Audit Report, DHS	

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Audit Number. 2024-1-36			Date. 0/15/2025
Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
			Lastly, the Agency is currently developing the inventory management training to emphasize the instructions on how to maintain and document inventory records.
Recommendation 11:	Agree	Status – Partially Implemented	Disagree with an explanation
Monitor the JRR contract to ensure that government resources are used only for expenses that are allowable, supported, and program appropriate.	DHS monitors all contracts and spending on a regular basis. A key component of invoice review is confirming that funds have been spent on allowable purposes in accordance with program budget. DHS follows MOCS' most recent invoice review policy, which requires the agency to do post-payment review of expenditures. Agency Corrective Action: Conduct post-payment review and if DHS determines that any funds were disbursed for ineligible costs, we will recoup. In addition, as noted above, DSS/DHS regularly audits providers, including BRC and the JRR program, to do a deeper dive into spending and program accountability.	Agency Action – As indicated above, DHS took additional steps to monitor JRR contract. While we acknowledge the work DHS performed in response to the initial audit, we also noted that many recommendations have not been fully implemented. DHS officials can take additional steps to help ensure that government resources are used only for expenses that are allowable, supported, and program appropriate.	

Audit Name: Follow Up Audit of DHS Oversight of Contract Expenditures of Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) – Agency Response to Final Report

Recommendations	Agency Response to 2019-N-8 Audit	OSC Summary Conclusions and Status of Audit Recommendations	Agency Response
			 Targeted training for Agency staff and providers Regular reminders to providers on key requirements, including timely budget closeouts. Adherence to citywide policies, such as the MOCS SIRP procedure. Disallowance and recovery of unsupported or unallowable expenses.